

September 2021 Historic Resources Committee Packet
September 10, 2021, 11:00 AM – 12:50 PM

This packet contains various materials to guide meeting discussions. The materials are listed below, linked and with reference to their page in the PDF file.

1. [September 9, 2021 HRC Meeting Notes](#) Page 02 of PDF
2. [Walking Tour Map Estimate](#) Page 06 of PDF
3. [2016 City Council Resolution on Vinegar Hill Park](#) Page 07 of PDF
4. [February 2020 Letter from HRC to City Council about V.H. Park](#) Page 08 of PDF
5. [Adopted HRC Operating Procedures](#) Page 11 of PDF
6. [Proposed Amendments to HRC Operating Procedures](#) Page 15 of PDF

MEETING NOTES

Charlottesville Historic Resources Committee^[1]_{SEP}

Friday, August 13, 2021; 11:00 a.m. – 1 p.m.

Remote meeting via Zoom

HRC Members present

Phil Varner, Chair

Sally Duncan, Vice-chair

Kay Slaughter

Dede Smith

Genevieve Keller

Jalane Schmidt

Jessica Livingston

Rachel Lloyd

HRC Members not present

Heather Hill

William Clay III

Margaret O’Bryant

Staff present

Jeff Werner

Robert Watkins

1. Call to order:

- a. Virtual introductions
- b. Public comments

The HRC receives no public comment.

2. Approval of the agenda:

Dede Smith moves to approve agenda, Kay Slaughter seconds. Motion passes unanimously.

3. Approval of meeting notes:

- a. July 9, 2021 HRC Meeting Notes

Smith moves to approve notes. Slaughter seconds. Motion passes unanimously.

4. Engagement of the Descendant Community for Court Square/Slave Auction Block site:

- a. Determine next steps (develop an online survey form, establish dates and locations for in-person meetings, coordinate a moderator, etc.) and review Rubric for Engaging Descendant Communities (found in the packet).
- b. Establish the project’s goal. Staff suggests: *The engagement process is a listening process only, not a design process, which only City Council can authorize and initiate. From the descendant input, the HRC will develop and present to City Council recommendations for how the City might memorialize the legacy of slavery, particularly as it relates to Court Square.*

HRC members plan to reach out to Mabel Wilson for question session and work session.

Staff expects that any in-person engagement is off the table for any foreseeable future.

Update from Jalane Schmidt regarding Memory Project at UVA: project to fund student researchers to do archival research of sales of enslaved people at Court Square, to build some sort of database. This research project would have periodic presentations and culminate in a written report to present to City Council.

Committee should urge Council to include engagement and historic research regarding sales at Court Square in future parks redesign requests for proposal (RFP).

Committee's letter to Council can encourage memorialization as well as including acknowledgement of enslavement at other places encompassed in RFP.

Priority should be a short online conversation with Wilson, to know what the big picture is, before planning more intensive work session.

Over the next few months, Phil Varner suggests HRC develop specific points for each park location that should be considered in the plan.

A history teacher at Charlottesville High School contacted Varner about potential student involvement at Court Square memorialization, looking at history and possible memorialization proposals.

5. Downtown Walking Tour Map Update:

- a. Review sites and organization of new walking tour map
- b. Discuss using HRC funds to hire a designer.

Walking tour map subcommittee had met with designer Anne Chesnut after last meeting. Important to design map to understand how much text to draft at each map stop.

Subcommittee advises that reducing review periods will keep costs down. If most edits/reviews happen intra-committee, it'll be cheaper and more efficient.

Smith recommends going ahead with hiring designer before discussion on who will bear printing costs. Once we have a design going, HRC can market it to other organizations to see if they want to contribute.

Genevieve Keller has concerns about digital format: in addition to print format, will these be designed for digital engagement as well?

Slaughter moves that we allocate up to \$8,000 for the design and printing (so we don't have to re-allocate for printing later), in agreement that we would ask other organizations later. Staff will also investigate digital options with map designer.

Lloyd seconds motion. Motion passes unanimously.

Varner moves to move rules of procedure discussion to next on docket. Lloyd seconds. Passes unanimously.

6. Amend Rules of Procedure:

- a. Discuss proposed amendments regarding public comment and membership (as seen in packet)

Purpose of discussion: to bring by-laws in compliance with actual operations of committee. Clarifying that there are 12 voting members appointed by councils, with two official ex-officio members (members because of the position they hold within City government). Jeff Werner is a member, as well as City Council member. HRC can also appoint additional ex-officio members so they can operate within committee.

Previously, bylaws stated they can appoint unlimited ex-officio members who vote, Varner suggests limiting to two.

Varner also recommends amending by-laws to actually include public comment policy.

The agenda in the by-laws is significantly different from agenda that committee follows. HRC should move approval of agenda to before public comment.

Add line that ex-officio members do not contribute to quorum.

At September meeting, motion to approve amendments.

7. Vinegar Hill Park Signage:

- a. discuss proposed signage at Vinegar Hill Park

Park has previously been established, at urging of committee, with recommendation for signage.

Park signage would include wayfinding signs, metal banners for light posts, monument sign. \$15,000 budget floated in staff report to council for signage.

Before staff gets current estimates for signage costs, committee should determine what is to be estimated, and if they need additional funding from Council.

Committee members remark that historical interpretation on proposed signage is not extensive.

Members propose that HRC wait until after Downtown Mall study and park redesign, since there's never been a park design: right now, primarily consists of signs. Recommendation that committee table it, until there's strong sentiment to claim it as Vinegar Hill space.

Committee should consider value in claiming space now with some sort of markers, to make sure it doesn't get lost in the future.

8. Resolution Thanking Ellen Wagner for Service on Committee:
Slaughter moves to approve the following resolution:

WHEREAS, Ellen Wagner was appointed in June 2013 by City Council to the serve on the Historic Resources Committee and continued to serve through July 2021; and

WHEREAS, the Historic Resources Committee was established by City Council to advocate for historic preservation; to promote an appreciation of local historic resources, both tangible and intangible; and to encourage and coordinate, with appropriate municipal agencies, civic organizations, institutions and individual scholars, the documentation and interpretation of local history; and

WHEREAS, during Ellen's eight years of service, the Historic Resources Committee accomplished its charge through projects that include the repair of the Fairfax Taylor headstone and rededication of the gravesite, facilitation of the initiative to restore and interpret the Daughters of Zion Cemetery, rededication ceremonies for the Maplewood and Oakwood cemeteries, establishment of the Vinegar Hill Park and the installation of a temporary exhibit expressing the history of Vinegar Hill, development of the Downtown Walking Tour Map, and providing funding and support for the historic survey of the 10th and Page Neighborhood and for the examination of the unmarked graves of enslaved persons at Pen Park; and, in many other ways, successfully promoted the Committee's educational and advocacy mission;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the City of Charlottesville's Historic Resources Committee thanks Ellen Wagner for her service to the City and its citizens, all of whom have benefited from her dedication and service.

Keller seconds. Motion passes unanimously.

9. Staff Updates:

Staff updates committee about Pen Park descendant discovery, and Downtown Mall landscape study.

Attention

Dede Smith
Katherine Slaughter

Charlottesville | Walking Trail map

Project scope

Design and layout through production for the walking trail spec'd as follows:
- full color, two-sided brochure trim size 18x24", folds to 4x9" to create 12 panels containing two maps, site descriptions, photographs, icons for trail types

Design and layout

A | Concept & prototype development

Organizational meeting and review of materials	1.00 – 2.00
Prototype design including, version #1	20.00 – 33.00
- design of brochure	
- creation of two multi-layer, vector based maps of trail areas including details of buildings, roads, green spaces, etc. used for site location	
- copy placement for style and word counts	
- photo placement for style or digital manipulation of actual photos	
- creation of mark or other element to designate kind of trail	
- general print estimate for brochure	
- review meeting	

B | Layout

Version 2-4	
- brochure production schedule	
- layout adjusted with actual copy and photographs	
- finalization of maps	
- photo review, selections, sizing, final digital manipulation as needed	
- file review	
- client AAs/copy edits to round 2; any additional copy and photos placed; if applicable client selection from alt. treatments	
- versions 4*, an additional AAs/clients edits to round 2 & 3 full layout plus	6.00 – 9.00

B | Finalization and production

Finalization of printing specifications and estimates; print instructions for production & delivery; review of printer's proof	1.00 – 2.00
Finalization and release of production files in different formats:	
- images finalized for print & print file release of native file or print PDFx	
- web PDF for posting, if desired	2.00 – 4.00

30.0 – 50.00 hours

design range**	low range	30 hours x \$80/hr	= \$2,400.00
	mid range	45 hours x \$80/hr	= \$3,600.00
	high range	50 hours x \$80/hr	= \$4,900.00

C | Reimbursable

Stock photography, <i>If applicable</i>	
<i>Cost per photo from iStock.com, commonly used, is \$12 or \$36.</i>	? photos x \$12 = \$??
	? photos x \$36 = \$??

\$ to be determined

D | Additional client edits, *If applicable*

*Client AAs beyond first 3 rounds (versions 2, 3, 4) will be billed by quarter hours at the rate of \$80/hour.

**Design estimate based on 5 academic and non-profit trail maps for several entities.

**RESOLUTION
TO RESERVE A PORTION OF THE DOWNTOWN PEDESTRIAN MALL,
AS DEFINED IN CITY CODE SEC. 28-2(b), AS AN AREA TO
BE NAMED "VINEGAR HILL PARK"**

WHEREAS, the City's Historic Resources committee has recommended that, in commemoration of the historical significance of the Vinegar Hill neighborhood, a portion of the public right-of-way at the west end of the Downtown Pedestrian Mall should be reserved, landscaped and improved as an area to be known as "Vinegar Hill Park"; and

WHEREAS, this project will implement a concept originally shown within Lawrence Halprin's original plan for the Downtown Mall (ca. 1974) and the proposed improvements include signage and kiosks that will educate the general public about the historical significance of the Vinegar Hill neighborhood;

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved by the Charlottesville City Council that a portion of the public right-of-way located at the west end of the Downtown Pedestrian Mall, as that term is defined in City Code Sec. 28-2(b), shall be reserved and improved as shown within a document titled "*Concept Plan and Signage Details for proposed Vinegar Hill Park by Laura Knott, ASLA, July 20, 2016*", hereafter to be known as "Vinegar Hill Park"; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT Vinegar Hill Park shall be and remain part of the public right-of-way referenced in City Code Sec. 28-2(b). The NDS Director and the City's Fire Official shall update the maps referred to within Sec. 28-2(b), (c), and (d), as may be necessary as a result of the improvements authorized within this resolution.

Approved by Council
December 5, 2016



Clerk of Council



Madeleine Hawks, Chair
Historic Resources Committee
City of Charlottesville
Department of Neighborhood Development Services
Attn: Staff Contact Jeff Werner
City Hall - 610 E. Market Street
Charlottesville, Virginia 22902
HRC@charlottesville.org

RE: Vinegar Hill Park (memo to Council)

February 17, 2020

Dear Mayor Walker and City Councillors,

Given that the composition of City Council has changed completely in the last three years, we hope to communicate the following recommendations and updates to the new Council regarding ongoing commemoration in the area known as Vinegar Hill:

- The HRC has formed a Vinegar Hill Subcommittee to consider issues relating to Vinegar Hill. In January, a former resident of Vinegar Hill joined the Subcommittee.
- To best incorporate the desires, stories, and remembrances of those who lived in Vinegar Hill, and their families, the HRC has agreed to partner with the Jefferson School African American Heritage Center (JSAAHC), which is in the process of forming an advisory committee of former residents and their relatives. At the direction of JSAAHC Executive Director Andrea Douglas, and with facilitation by JSAAHC Fellow and HRC member Jordy Yager, this advisory committee will inform the HRC's work and direction when considering any future memorialization involving Vinegar Hill.
- The HRC urges the City to support fundraising for the Vinegar Hill Monument, intended for installation on the historic Jefferson School property, near the intersection of 4th Street NW and Commerce Street. It was designed by Melvin Edwards, a world-renowned African American sculptor. The monument's design was an action-item from the robust community engagement efforts of the City-sponsored Dialogue on Race program in 2011, and the City provided funds for artist selection. In 2017, the City's Blue

Ribbon Commission on Race, Memorials, and Public Space listed the monument's installation as one of its recommendations. Support could come in the form of direct allocations, and/or consciousness-raising efforts for fundraising.

- In December, 2016, the City of Charlottesville passed a resolution to designate a portion of the Downtown Pedestrian Mall as, "Vinegar Hill Park," and to allocate \$15,000 for signage to identify the area as, "Vinegar Hill Park." The area is now under redesign for ADA accessibility in concert with the ongoing Center of Developing Entrepreneurs (CODE) project construction at the site of the former Main Street Arena. The HRC requests that City Council recommit to funding this signage. The Vinegar Hill Park shall serve as an introduction and gateway to the historic Jefferson School African American Heritage Center that is the focus of African American programming, interpretation, and legacy-building in the region. The HRC plans to recommit to an effort to provide limited (temporary?) interpretive signage for Vinegar Hill Park that is coordinated with the CODE project's ADA accessibility plans. The HRC should coordinate this effort with JSAAHC efforts to engage former residents to help craft the interpretive wording and details on signs.
- City Council should be aware that Vinegar Hill's historic limits extended beyond the area cleared during Urban Renewal. Some physical fabric remains as do portions of the historic street grid. Buildings on West Main Street including, and most notably, the former Inge's Store, a few surviving buildings on 4th Street, the Odd Fellows former hall (now the site of Common House), the current Fellini's Restaurant, the Artful Lodger (former A&P), and the other buildings on Market Street between Old Preston and 2nd Street all predate the demolition of most of Vinegar Hill as do several buildings on 2nd Street West, south of Market Street. The westernmost block of Main Street, as well as the sites of the Omni Hotel and the Federal Courthouse, are within the traditional boundaries of the area considered Vinegar Hill, and should be identified and interpreted as such in the designated park area. In consultation with the JSAAHC and the descendent community, the extent of the area traditionally considered as Vinegar Hill shall be identified and demarcated in a manner consistent with installations and demarcations in the Vinegar Hill Park and graphically depicted on a map in the park. New construction within these bounds should clearly identify that they replace the historic structures removed during Urban Renewal. Future demolitions should be reviewed in the context of the Vinegar Hill narrative and the contributions that the surviving buildings and the histories that they represent physically. Every effort shall be made to honor the legacy of this area that was so integral to the city's history and African American culture, commerce, and community life.
- The HRC will continue to add to the temporary signage addressing the history of Vinegar Hill on the construction fence surrounding the CODE building construction. The first set of seven (7) temporary signs were installed in October, 2019, and the HRC plans to add more signs over the course of 2020, pending necessary approvals. Themes for these new signs may include:

- Vinegar Hill: Then and Now
- Public Decisions and Leadership
- The Businesses of Vinegar Hill
- Selective Imagery/Propaganda leading to neighborhood demolition

If you have any questions, please contact me at 540-535-9632 or mdarcyhawks@gmail.com or email the whole committee: hrc@charlottesville.org.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Madeleine D. Hawks". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial "M" and a stylized "D" and "H".

Madeleine D. Hawks
Chair, Historic Resources Committee

City of Charlottesville Historic Resources Committee

RULES OF PROCEDURE

Adopted by the Charlottesville Historic Resources Committee July 12, 2010

Revised August 14, 2017

(Note: The Public Comment at Meetings policy was adopted at the January 17, 2020 meeting; however, it has not yet been formally incorporated into the Rules of Procedure.)

1. **Officers and Membership**

- A. Chair or Co-Chairs. At its annual meeting, the Committee shall elect a Chair or two Co-Chairs. The Chair or either of the Co-Chairs, by mutual consent, shall preside at the meeting and at all other meetings during the year for which elected.
- B. Vice-Chair. At its annual meeting, the Committee may elect a Vice-Chair, in lieu of a Co-Chair, who shall preside at meetings in the absence of the Chair, and shall discharge the duties of the Chair during their absence or disability.
- C. Secretary-Treasurer. The current Charlottesville Historic Preservation Planner or their representative shall serve as Secretary-Treasurer, and shall record the proceedings of the meetings. The Secretary-Treasurer shall keep the Committee apprised of budget appropriations for the Committee, expenditures, and funding needs.
- D. Term of Office. The Chair and Co-Chair or Vice-Chair shall be elected for one-year terms; but all may be re-elected for one or more additional terms.
- E. Absence of Chair and Co-Chair or Vice-Chair. If the Chair and Co-Chair or Vice-Chair are absent from any meeting, a present member shall be chosen to act as Chair for that meeting.
- F. Leaves of Absence. Upon the request of a member, the Committee may vote to allow that member to take a leave of absence from membership for no more than six months. No more than two voting members may be on leave of absence at the same time. For purposes of establishing a quorum, the voting membership of the committee shall be reduced by the number of members on leave of absence at the time the meeting is held.
- G. Ex-Officio Members. The Committee may designate ex-officio members. Ex-officio members shall be voting members.
- H. Advisory or Ad-hoc Members. The Committee may designate members as “Advisory” or “Ad-hoc” members for a particular project. Advisory or Ad-hoc members may participate in Committee discussions and Committee work, but they shall not be voting members and their attendance at a meeting shall not be counted towards that number required to constitute a quorum.

- I. Number of Members. Voting members of the Historic Resources Committee shall be appointed by City Council and shall be limited to twelve.
- J. Terms. Members shall serve three-year staggered terms with 1/3 of the membership appointed each year. Members have no term limits, but must reapply and be reappointed by City Council every three years.
- K. Committee Heads. At its annual meeting the Committee shall decide upon Committee Heads from its voting members, in order to accomplish its Annual Plan work program.
- L. New members. When the number of voting members falls below ten members, the Committee shall formally request that City Council appoint new members. The Committee may recommend to City Council persons from the community with qualifications or interests pertaining to preservation or history. The Committee openings shall be made public on the City's web site. Applicants shall submit application forms to the City Clerk.

2. Meetings

- A. Annual Meeting. The first meeting in January of each year shall be known as the annual meeting. At the annual meeting, the Committee shall establish the day, time, and place for regular meetings of the Committee for that year, and shall elect the Chair, Co-Chair or Vice-Chair.
- B. Annual Plan. No later than the first meeting in January of each year the Committee shall vote upon and establish an Annual Plan or work program for that year, and shall establish Committee Heads.
- C. Regular Meetings. The Committee shall meet in regular session at the time and place and on the day or days established for regular meetings. The Committee may subsequently establish a different day, time, or place to conduct its regular meetings by passing a resolution to that effect.

If the Chair or Co-Chair finds and declares that weather or other conditions are such that it is hazardous for Committee members to attend a regular meeting, the meeting shall be continued to the next regular meeting date. This finding shall be communicated to the members of the Committee and the Committee's web site as promptly as possible.

- D. Attendance. Two unreported absences from regular meetings shall be considered grounds for dismissal from the Committee.

3. Order of Business

- A. Establishment of Agenda. The agenda for each regular meeting shall be

established by staff. At the beginning of each meeting the Committee may make changes to the agenda.

B. Organization of the Agenda. The agenda of each regular meeting shall be organized in substantially the following order, subject to change at the request of the Chair and with the consensus of the other members of the Committee:

- (1) Call to order and agenda changes
- (2) Approval of minutes
- (3) Education & Public Meetings
- (4) Public Commemoration
- (5) Publications
- (6) Special Projects
- (7) Other business
- (8) Goals for Next meeting
- (9) Adjourn

C. Deferrals. The Committee may defer any matter at the request of a member of the Committee, or staff. The request may be either oral or in writing, and may be made at any time prior to the vote on the matter. The person making the request shall state the reasons therefor. A motion to defer shall either specify the date to which the matter is deferred or defer the matter indefinitely.

4. Quorum

Half of the voting members shall constitute a quorum. If there are an odd number of voting members, a quorum shall be half the members and one. If, during a meeting, less than a quorum remain present, no action can be taken except to adjourn the meeting.

5. Voting Procedures

A. Approval of Motion by Majority. Each decision of the Committee shall be made by approval of a majority of the members present and voting on a motion properly made by a member and properly seconded by another member. Any motion that is not seconded shall not be further considered.

B. Manner of Vote. The vote on a motion shall be by voice vote, provided that a roll call vote on such a motion shall be required if requested by a member of the Committee. For each roll call vote, staff shall record the name of each member voting and how the member voted on the motion. For each voice vote, staff shall record the result of the vote.

C. Tie Vote. A tie vote shall defeat the motion voted upon.

- D. Abstention. If any member abstains from voting on any motion, they shall state their abstention. The abstention shall be announced by the Chairman and recorded by staff.
- E. Motion to Amend. A motion to amend a motion before the Committee shall be discussed and voted by the Committee before any vote is taken on the original motion unless the motion to amend is accepted by both the members making and seconding the original motion. If the motion to amend is approved, the amended motion is then before the Committee for its consideration. If the motion to amend is not approved, the original motion is again before the Committee for its consideration.

6. Amendment of Rules of Procedure

These Rules of Procedure may be amended by a majority vote of the Committee at the next regular meeting following a regular meeting at which notice of the motion to amend is given.

7. Rules of Procedure not Covered by These Rules of Procedure

Any rules of procedure not covered by these Rules of Procedure shall be governed by the current Robert's Rules of Order.

* * * * *

Public Comment at Meetings

At the beginning of each meeting, not more than 10 minutes will be allowed for the introduction of any guests and public comments. Speakers may speak for a maximum of two-minutes and shall begin by identifying their name and address. The intent is to allow public input; not initiate a dialogue or debate with the committee. Subsequent to this meeting segment, by majority approval the HRC may amend the agenda to allow further discussion; however the motion should also establish a time limit for that discussion. Additionally, prior to adjourning--and applying conditions above--the HRC may allow a period not to exceed five minutes for public comment.

(January 17, 2020)

Proposed amendments to HRC Operating Procedures

Membership

Current:

1. G. Ex-Officio Members. The Committee may designate ex-officio members. Ex-officio members shall be voting members.

Amended:

1.G. Ex-Officio Members. The Historic Preservation and Design Planner for the City of Charlottesville is a non-voting ex-officio member of the committee.

City Council may designate one non-voting ex-officio member who is a member of City Council. The Committee may designate other ex-officio members, who may be designated as voting or non-voting members.

Current:

1. I. Number of Members. Voting members of the Historic Resources Committee shall be appointed by City Council and shall be limited to twelve.

Amended:

1. I. Regular Members. Regular members of the Historic Resources Committee shall be appointed by City Council and shall be limited to twelve. Regular members shall be voting members.

Public Comment

Current:

None

Amended:

(add) in section 3.B. insert "Public Comment" between existing items (1) and (2)

(add) 2. E. Public Comment at Meetings

At the beginning of each meeting, not more than 10 minutes will be allowed for the introduction of any guests and public comments. Speakers may speak for a maximum of two-minutes and shall begin by identifying their name and address. The intent is to

allow public input; not initiate a dialogue or debate with the committee. Subsequent to this meeting segment, by majority approval the HRC may amend the agenda to allow further discussion; however the motion should also establish a time limit for that discussion. Additionally, prior to adjourning--and applying conditions above--the HRC may allow a period not to exceed five minutes for public comment.

Agenda

Current:

Organization of the Agenda. The agenda of each regular meeting shall be organized in substantially the following order, subject to change at the request of the Chair and with the consensus of the other members of the Committee:

- (1) Call to order and agenda changes
- (2) Approval of minutes
- (3) Education & Public Meetings
- (4) Public Commemoration
- (5) Publications
- (6) Special Projects
- (7) Other business
- (8) Goals for Next meeting
- (9) Adjourn

Amended:

Organization of the Agenda. The agenda of each regular meeting shall be organized in substantially the following order, subject to change at the request of the Chair and with the consensus of the other members of the Committee:

1. Call to Order
2. Roll Call of Board Member
3. Approval of Agenda
4. Comments from Members of the Community
5. Approval of meeting notes
6. Announcements
7. Education & Public Meetings
8. Public Commemoration
9. Publications
10. Special Projects
11. Staff Updates, not otherwise covered

12. Other business
13. Coordinate Agenda for next HRC Meeting
14. Adjourn