Human Rights Commission
Meeting Minutes
Regular Meeting
May 20, 2021
Virtual/Electronic Meeting
6:30 pm

Public link to meeting rebroadcasts on Boxcast: https://boxcast.tv/channel/vabajtzezuyv3iclkx1a

Public link to HRC documents on Box: https://app.box.com/s/xty3wnn2s1tj8h7trkknvd79bipyxezy

1. **WELCOME**
   a. CALL TO ORDER
      i. Chair, Mary Bauer, called the meeting to order at 6:35 pm
   b. ROLL CALL
      i. Mary Bauer
      ii. Kathryn Laughon
      iii. Jeanette Abi-Nader
      iv. Ernest Chambers
      v. Jessica Harris
      vi. Wolfgang Keppley
      vii. Sue Lewis
      viii. Tobiah Mundt
      ix. Alex Oxford
      x. Lyndele von Schill
   c. MISSION (recited by all): *Act as a strong advocate to justice and equal opportunity by providing citywide leadership and guidance in the area of civil rights.*
2. **MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC**
   a. PUBLIC COMMENT
      i. None.
   b. COMMISSION RESPONSE TO MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC
      i. None.
3. **MINUTES**
   a. Review of minutes from May 6, 2021
      i. Vote
         1. In favor: 9
         2. Can live with: 0
         3. Opposed: 0
         4. Abstained: 0
      ii.
4. **BUSINESS MATTERS**
   a. OHR Staff report
      i. Staff reviews key points on written staff report from agenda packet.
      ii. Chair requests update on Director hiring process
         1. Staff notes that the City Manager has offered the Commission a

chance to be a part of the hiring process

   iii. Ashley Reynolds Marshall, Deputy City Manager for REDI provides an update regarding hiring process
1. Has not yet seen applicants yet
2. Process is in Human Resources' hands currently
3. Confirms that City Manager would like HRC involved in process

   iv. Chair asks Ashley how HRC should engage in hiring process
1. Ashley reports that the City Manager will contact HRC and OHR regarding involvement in the hiring process

   v. Commissioner asks if application period for the Director has closed
1. Ashley confirms that it has closed
2. Notes that Human Resources will likely share a jump drive with all candidate information soon
     a. This was the process for the PCRB Director hiring

   vi. Chair expresses need to think about HRC official action between regular meetings regarding the hiring process, as this would require public notice if more than one Commissioner were to participate
1. OHR staff reads the email below from the City Manager, which offers several options for HRC participation:
     a. *"The Commission will definitely be included in the initial round of the hiring process as well as will be asked as the Commission for the consent to hire a recommended Director. There are two ways the Commission may participate. Up to two members of the Commission may participate in interviews as panel members, or the whole Commission may meet within an approved closed meeting and interview a short list of candidates and make a recommendation to the City Manager. City Manager would in turn at a later meeting make a recommendation back to the Commission for their consent. I am OK with either. The meeting as a whole may add some time to the process (a little) because a special meeting may have to be added. I would welcome your input on your preferred participation."*

   vii. Chair suggests that HRC participate, as a whole, in the interview process
1. Commissioners express general support for this option
2. Concern expressed that, due to scheduling, some Commissioners may not be able to participate

   viii. Chair asks about the potential for HRC in-person meetings
1. OHR staff reports that City Space is still closed to the public with no definite re-opening date
2. OHR staff notes that office will open when two interns start in June
     a. Will open to in-person appointments and follow mask

protocol when members of the public are present
3. Commissioner expresses support for continuation of virtual meetings noting the accessibility of virtual meetings
   a. Suggests that virtual might be the default unless in-person is needed or that if in-person becomes the standard that a virtual option remain available
4. OHR staff notes that the HRC may still have the opportunity for televised broadcast of in-person meetings
   ix. Commissioner asks about the OHR Departmental Scorecard – Do other departments have this and how much time does it take to maintain it?
   1. OHR staff provides an overview of the scorecard system
      a. Notes that the scorecard serves as a foundation for the OHR/HRC annual report
      b. Notes that satisfaction and participation survey results are limited due to insufficient staffing to complete the work
         i. Intent to conduct individual services satisfaction surveys with support of summer interns
b. Chair Update
   i. Notes that Shantell Bingham has left Charlottesville and is no longer a member of the Commission
      1. Suggests that HRC should consider appointing a new member to the Housing Committee to continue its work
   ii. Raises the question of follow-up regarding HRC statement on police violence and City budget transparency
      1. Commissioner asks if there was a response from Council
         a. Chair notes that there was no response
      2. Commissioner suggests requesting a response from Council
      3. Commissioner suggests a request for response by email prior to attending a Council meeting
         a. Commissioner suggests presenting a specific request as to what the HRC would expect to see in the budget
      4. Commissioner asks if Ashley has seen the letter
         a. Ashley has not read it yet, but acknowledges that it is in the HRC agenda packet
      5. Mary will send an email follow-up to City Manager and City Council regarding the statement on police violence ahead of potentially raising the issue at a future Council meeting
         a. Commission shows general consensus to this action
c. Time for Commissioner and Deputy City Manager introductions

5. **WORK SESSION**
   a. Committee Reports
      i. Accessibility Committee (Committee Chair – Wolfgang)
         1. Did not meet since last HRC regular meeting
         2. Committee Chair is looking into language accessibility plans from other Commissions and cities
         3. Commissioner notes that one concern it would like to address is that ADA Coordinator is under NDS
         4. HRC Chair asks if City has an accessibility plan

      a. Committee Chair notes that ADA Transition Plan was last updated in 2013

      b. HRC formerly had representation on the ADA Advisory Committee which assists the ADA Coordinator in drafting the ADA Transition Plan

      c. HRC has not been invited to provide input this time yet

5. HRC Chair asks if the ADA Transition Plan addresses language issues or only ADA issues

      a. Committee Chair notes that the Plan only addresses disability issues as relate to the ADA

6. HRC Chair asks if the City has a language access plan for non-English speakers

      a. None known

7. Accessibility Committee next steps

      a. Schedule a committee meeting before the next HRC regular meeting in June

      b. Research City's current language accessibility plans, if any, and discuss possibility of further action if none exists

      c. Continue dialogue with ADA Advisory Committee and ADA Coordinator regarding updates to the ADA Transition Plan

  ii. Community Engagement (Committee Chair – Jessica)

1. Committee Chair provided a summary of the previous committee meeting

2. OHR staff follow-up

      a. In discussion with City Manager, Deputy City Manager for REDI, and Communications Director about the key points raised in the last committee meeting regarding social media and communications generally.

      b. Notes that draft resolution regarding HRC actions between meetings is included in agenda packet as a potential template for the committee to use as a communications plan resolution

3. Deputy City Manager for REDI follow-up

      a. Confirms the ability to create City emails for all Commissioners

        i. Allows easier archive and FOIA

      b. Online posting of HRC work

        i. OHR staff can create links to HRC work and documents from OHR website

        ii. Once Commissioners have City emails can move from Box to One Drive

      c. Facebook

        i. No other boards and commissions have Facebook

        ii. Some City departments use for "breaking news" announcements, ex. utility or public works updates

        iii.   Suggest adding OHR staff and other key City staff to existing Facebook account that Charlene can access

        iv.   A Communications team member will be included as an admin. for auto-archiving

        v.   Once Director is in place, will discuss whether Director or other OHR staff will manage site

        vi.   If HRC has other events or community announcements can share with Communications for publication on City media accounts

    d.   City email distribution list

        i.   Can move subscribers from Mail Chimp to this system

        ii.   Subscribers can choose the types of City information they would like to receive

        iii.   Would likely increase number of people who sign up for information as Human Rights will be included on the list

    e.   Other public engagement tools

        i.   Townhall-type tools for community surveys and other engagement

        ii.   May offer other times for people to engage outside of live meeting times

        iii.   Improves accessibility

    f.   Proposal for hybrid live/ virtual meetings

        i.   Confirms that this will be offered for 8 boards and commissions

        ii.   Brian has suggested that HRC be one of the 8

        iii.   Would include TV broadcast, Boxcast, and other archive options

4.   Committee Chair asks for confirmation that HRC statements can be posted on City website and Facebook

    a.   Deputy City Manager confirms

    b.   Cannot go on homepage banner of City website

        i.   Not a City statement

5.   Committee Chair asks if HRC can provide the content for OHR staff to post on Facebook

    a.   Deputy City Manager confirms

    b.   City staff will be on the admin. for

        i.   Technical assistance

        ii.   Legal questions

        iii.   Responses to offensive public comments

        iv.   Archiving

        v.   Will not micro-manage page

        vi.   May also hire a social media expert to assist

    c.   Deputy City Manager suggests not using Twitter

        i.   Requires constant management

        ii.   Facebook is a more functional platform for the

purposes of the HRC

6. Committee Chair notes that for some Twitter is the primary platform and suggests that it might be worth still considering
7. Commissioner raises idea of virtual Commissioner participation in future meetings as a means of furthering accessibility
    a. Notes specifically that night driving can be difficult for individuals with visual impairments and thus an in-person meeting requirement is a barrier
8. Chair asks if the hybrid meeting approach will include continued virtual participation by Commissioners
    a. Deputy City Manager response
        i. References potential regulation that prohibits continued virtual meetings following the lifting of emergency order by Governor
    b. Deputy City Attorney response
        i. Under FOIA laws, after the state of emergency executive orders are repealed, Commissioners must resume in-person meetings
        ii. HRC has some provisions in its bylaws that allow limited remote participation
        iii. Members of the public can still participate remotely through the hybrid approach, but Commissioners must be physically present
        iv. City Council has authority to continue its state of emergency for an additional six months beyond the repeal of the Governor's order
9. Chair asks about timeframe for City re-opening
    a. Deputy City Attorney response
        i. Current understanding is that by the time school starts in the fall of 2021 the City will back to full, in-person operations
10. Commissioner asks if some Commissioners can participate virtually if there is an in-person quorum
    a. Deputy City Manager response
        i. Under FOIA laws, Commissioners must be present to vote
        ii. Bylaws allow limited remote participation, pursuant to state FOIA law
11. Commissioner suggests that this could be a matter to raise in the HRC's General Assembly legislative agenda recommendations to Council
12. Chair asks what actions the HRC needs to take to verify its interest in pursuing hybrid meetings in the future
    a. Deputy City Manager response
        i. Asks that the HRC record in the minutes if there is consensus regarding
            1. City emails for Commissioners
            2. Desire for hybrid meetings, post-pandemic

13. OHR staff asks if state FOIA law allows for reasonable accommodation on the basis of disability for remote meeting participation
    a. Deputy City Attorney response
        i. State law addresses illness or need to care for a family member
14. Chair asks Commission if there is general consensus regarding the adoption of City emails for Commissioners
    a. All in favor
15. Chair asks Commission if there is general consensus regarding the desire for hybridized meetings once the state of emergency is lifted
    a. All in favor
b. Housing Committee (Committee Co-Chair – Tobiah)
    i. Committee did not meet since last HRC regular meeting
    ii. Request for additional members
        1. Kathryn Laughon volunteers
        2. Sue Lewis volunteers
    iii. Chair notes recent activity regarding zoning and the desire by CLIHC and other groups to respond from the standpoint of racial equity
    iv. Committee will schedule a meeting
c. Legal Representation Committee
    i. Jessica provides a summary of the previous meeting
    ii. Draft resolution under consideration
    iii. Committee will plan to meet again before next HRC regular meeting
d. OHR staff requests volunteer note-takers for committee meetings
    i. General consensus that committees can handle note-taking

6. **MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC**
    a. PUBLIC COMMENT
        i. None.
    b. COMMISSION RESPONSE TO MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC
        i. None.

7. **COMMISSIONER UPDATES**
    a. Sue
        i. VAHR update
            1. All HRC members are on roster
            2. VAHR annual meeting: June 5, 2021
        ii. Commissioner asks if there is any prep work before VAHR meeting
            1. Sue notes that there is no prep work
            2. Focus may be on Commission best practices
    b. Jeanette
        i. Cville Plans Together taking input on
            1. Comprehensive Plan
            2. Land Use Plan
            3. Affordable Housing Plan
        ii. Link to public input site
            1. https://cvilleplanstogether.com/
        iii. CLIHC has a sign-on regarding the Affordable Housing Plan
        iv. Cultivate Charlottesville has a sign-on regarding Food Equity

       v.   Notes that at the last Planning Commission Steering Committee meeting there was public resistance to density increases
- 1. Encourages HRC to view this as an equity issue
     vi.   Commissioner notes that the land-use survey is daunting and that skimming through the first pages may be helpful to get to the actual survey
    vii.   Public comment is due on May 31st
- 1. It will likely be extended, as there is interest in a longer comment period
   viii.   OHR staff response
- 1. Notes that Liz Russell, Planning Commissioner, reached out regrading equity concerns
- 2. Asks if HRC would like a representative from the Planning Commission to attend and present concerns to the HRC
    ix.   Chair asks if this should be a Housing Committee or full Commission issue
- 1. General consensus that the full Commission would like to engage
- 2. May still be valuable even if public comment period is closed
    x.   Next steps regarding Comprehensive Plan advocacy
- 1. Jeanette will reach out to Cville Plans Together about participation in the next HRC regular meeting
- 2. OHR staff will reach out to Liz Russel about participation in the next HRC regular meeting

8. **NEXT STEPS**
   a. OHR staff will work with committees to schedule meetings before the June HRC regular meeting
   b. Mary will send an email follow-up to City Manager and City Council regarding the statement on police violence ahead of potentially raising the issue at a future Council meeting
   c. Next steps regarding Comprehensive Plan advocacy
      i. Jeanette will reach out to Cville Plans Together about participation in the next HRC regular meeting
      ii. OHR staff will reach out to Liz Russel about participation in the next HRC regular meeting

9. **ADJOURN**
   a. Meeting adjourned at 8:10pm.