



**Human Rights Commission
Annual Retreat and Strategic Planning Meeting
Thursday, March 16, 2023
Hybrid Meeting (in person meeting with remote participation available)
Carver Recreation Center Main Room, 233 4th St. NW, Charlottesville, VA 22902
5:30pm**

Agenda Packet Attachments

1. Agenda
2. CY2022 HRC Work Summary
3. CY2022 HRC Retreat Focus Area Summary

Attachment 1



**Human Rights Commission
AGENDA
Annual Retreat and Strategic Planning Meeting
Thursday, March 16, 2023
Hybrid Meeting (in person meeting with remote participation available)
Carver Recreation Center Main Room, 233 4th St. NW, Charlottesville, VA 22902
5:30pm**

Please take Notice that this hybrid meeting of the Human Rights Commission is for the purposes of planning, developing, and drafting management and administration documents for the Human Rights Commission. This hybrid meeting will be a limited public forum to discuss the agenda items presented below and to ensure the continuity of services provided by the Commission. The Commission Chair may limit public comments or discussion points that are unrelated to agenda items or that pertain to topics outside the scope of this Agenda. This will be a hybrid meeting open to the public and registration information for remote participation is available at www.charlottesville.gov/zoom.

The Commission welcomes comments and questions and commits to listening carefully and thoughtfully to what is presented. A maximum of sixteen public comment time slots are allotted per meeting. Each speaker will have three minutes to speak. The Commission requests that members of the public refrain from engaging in personal attacks against Commissioners and staff members and asks that comments and questions focus on matters related to human rights within the City.

1. WELCOME

- a. CALL TO ORDER
- b. ROLL CALL
- c. MISSION (recited by all): *Act as a strong advocate to justice and equal opportunity by providing citywide leadership and guidance in the area of civil rights.*
- d. Icebreaker
- e. Privilege Bead Activity

2. WORK SESSION

- a. 2022 Annual Report overview
- b. Charlottesville Human Rights Ordinance Sec. 2-433 and Sec. 2-434 overview
- c. 2023 Strategic Planning

3. MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC

- a. PUBLIC COMMENT (Webinar attendees use the “raise hand” function, phone attendees use *9)
- b. COMMISSION RESPONSE TO MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC

4. COMMISSIONER UPDATES

5. NEXT STEPS & ADJOURN

*** ACTION NEEDED**

Individuals with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in the public meeting may call the ADA Coordinator at (434) 970-3182 or submit a request via email to ada@charlottesville.gov. The City of Charlottesville requests that you provide a 48-hour notice so that proper arrangements may be made.

Attachment 2

Charlottesville Human Rights Commission (HRC)

Calendar Year 2022 (CY2022)

Key Actions and Takeaways

The purpose of this document is to provide the HRC with information that may inform their strategic planning for fiscal year CY2023. While the focus of this summary is the work of the HRC, a summary of key data from the work of the OHR is also included that includes the major trends in individual service provision. The Charlottesville Human Rights Ordinance (CRHO), Code of the City of Charlottesville, Chapter 2, Article XV, is the guiding document that defines the work of the HRC and OHR. The work of the HRC and OHR in CY2022 was guided by the version of the CHRO that was adopted by City Council on February 1, 2021.

The CRHO defines the work of the HRC in five main sections:

- Sec. 2-433. Role of the Human Rights Commission.
- Sec. 2-434. Duties and responsibilities – Community dialogue and engagement.
- Sec. 2-435. Duties and responsibilities – Systemic issues.
- Sec. 2-439.1. Enforcement authority – The role of the Commission.

Sec. 2-433. opens with a statement, which the HRC has adopted as its mission. This section also provides a concise list of six roles (listed in the CHRO as “a-f”) fulfilled by the HRC. Secs. 2-434., 2-435., and 2-439.1 provide supplemental detail to the roles described in Sec. 2-433.

The HRC, during its annual retreat on April 23, 2022, identified four focus areas for its work during CY2022:

1. Housing Equity Assessment
2. Community Engagement
3. Equity in City Government Review
4. HRC & OHR Capacity Expansion

Below is a summary of the HRC’s work in CY2022 organized using the framework provided by the CHRO. If an action described below aligns with one of the HRC’s four focus areas this alignment is also indicated.

Sec. 2-433. (a)

Sec. 2-433. (a) Assist individuals who believe they are the victim of an act of unlawful discrimination within the City.

Most activities involving individual assistance rest with the OHR under Sec. 2-437. Duties and responsibilities – Investigation of individual complaints and issuance of findings. The HRC has a specific role pertaining to public hearings, as explained in *Sec. 2-439.1. Enforcement Authority – The Role of the Commission*. In the history of the HRC, only one complaint has required the HRC to hold a public hearing. No cases of discrimination required the HRC to hold a public hearing in CY2022.

Sec. 2-433. (b)

Sec. 2-433. (b) Collaborate with the public and private sectors for the purpose of providing awareness, education, and guidance on methods to prevent and eliminate discrimination citywide.

Key HRC Actions and Takeaways

The HRC engaged in four actions aligned with Sec. 2-433. (b) related to public awareness, education, and guidance, including further one community event, one public discussion, and two public polls.

Below is a chart summarizing the actions taken by the HRC and their alignment with the duties and responsibilities in *Sec. 2-434.* and *Sec. 2-435.* in the CHRO, as well as their alignment with the focus areas Commissioners identified during their annual retreat. Documents referenced in the action summaries are publicly posted on the “Human Rights Documents” subpage within the “Human Rights” webpage on the City website.

Date	Alignment	Action	Summary
1/20/2022	<p>Duties & Responsibilities: Sec. 2-434 Community dialogue and engagement.</p> <p>Annual Focus Areas: Community Engagement</p>	Public Poll	The HRC created a poll asking the public what topics they would like to see addressed in the Town Hall meeting on 3/24/2022. In 185 survey responses, respondents prioritized emergency housing and quality of affordable public and subsidized housing.
3/24/2022	<p>Duties & Responsibilities: Sec. 2-434 Community dialogue and engagement.</p> <p>Annual Focus Areas: Community Engagement</p>	Public Discussion	The HRC hosted a Town Hall discussion engaging the public on two topics that respondents of a poll deemed most pressing. Members of the public were given the opportunity to speak in three-minute intervals about emergency housing and/or the quality of affordable, public, and subsidized housing. Commissioners took ideas from this town hall into their annual retreat on 4/23/2022.
8/6/2022	<p>Duties & Responsibilities: Sec. 2-434 Community dialogue and engagement.</p> <p>Annual Focus Areas: Community Engagement</p>	Community Event	A Human Rights Commissioner assisted HRC staff with tabling at the annual Charlottesville Westhaven Community Day. Tabling consisted of engaging with the public and providing information about the HRC and its role in the City.

Date	Alignment	Action	Summary
9/16/2022	<p>Duties & Responsibilities: Sec. 2-434 Community dialogue and engagement.</p> <p>Annual Focus Areas: Community Engagement</p>	Public Poll	The HRC planned to publish a poll asking the public what topics they would like to see raised to Council in the HRC's annual legislative recommendations. The poll opened on September 16, 2022, and closed on October 1, 2022. It garnered 101 responses. In addition to the option of writing in suggestions, respondents were given the opportunity to designate a level of lowest to highest priority to several different given topics. The HRC discussed the survey's results during their meeting on 10/20/22 and used them to form legislative recommendations to Council.

Sec. 2-433. (c)

Sec. 2-433. (c) Identify and review policies and practices of the City of Charlottesville and its boards and commissions and other public agencies within the City and advise those bodies on issues related to human rights issues.

Key HRC Actions and Takeaways
The HRC engaged in six actions aligned with Sec. 2-433. (c), related to the review of City policies including two Council recommendations, two HRC resolutions, and two public discussions.

This role falls primarily with the HRC, with the OHR providing administrative support. The specific duties and responsibilities under this role are further explained in *Sec. 2-435. Duties and responsibilities – Systemic issues.*

Below is a chart summarizing the actions taken by the HRC and showing the alignment with the duties & responsibilities sections in the CHRO, as well as the focus areas Commissioners identified during their annual retreat. Documents referenced in the action summaries are publicly posted on the “Human Rights Documents” subpage within the “Human Rights” webpage on the City website.

Date	Alignment	Action	Summary
1/20/22	<p>Duties & Responsibilities: Sec. 2-434 Community dialogue and engagement.</p> <p>Annual Focus Areas: Equity in City government.</p>	HRC Resolution	<p>In late December of CY2021, the HRC passed Resolution HR21-1 to Establish a Citywide Language Access Plan. In CY2022, the HRC adopted the plain language version of Resolution HR21-1 and two accompanying plain-language flyers in English and Spanish. This resolution codified the Commission's recommendation that the City develop and implement a city-wide Language Access Plan, and the plain-language versions ensured that all residents are able to access and understand it.</p>
1/31/22	<p>Duties & Responsibilities: Sec. 2-435 Systemic Issues.</p> <p>Annual Focus Areas: No direct alignment.</p>	Council Recommendation	<p>The HRC sent a letter to City Council outlining concerns with the treatment of incarcerated people at Albemarle-Charlottesville Regional Jail (ACRJ) who had not been subjected to adequate sanitation and treatment practices during a COVID-19 outbreak.</p>
2/17/22	<p>Duties & Responsibilities: Sec. 2-435 Systemic Issues.</p> <p>Annual Focus Areas: No direct alignment.</p>	Public Discussion	<p>The HRC hosted a public, virtual discussion with Councilor Sena Magill, ACRJ Board Member, and Col. Martin Kumer, Superintendent of the ACRJ, as a follow-up to the letter to Council sent on 1/31/2022 regarding concerns about the ACRJ and the COVID-19 outbreak.</p>
2/22/22	<p>Duties & Responsibilities: Sec. 2-434 Community dialogue and engagement.</p> <p>Annual Focus Areas: Community Engagement.</p>	Public Discussion	<p>The HRC hosted a Public & Subsidized Housing Panel Discussion with speakers Victoria Horrock, attorney with the Legal Aid Justice Center (LAJC) and Shelby Edwards, Executive Director of Charlottesville Public Housing Association of Residents (PHAR). The speakers presented information on behalf of their respective organizations related to availability and conditions in subsidized housing. The panel discussion highlighted zoning, educating the public, and partnerships of power as important topics to pursue as a Commission in the future.</p>

Date	Alignment	Action	Summary
8/18/22	<p>Duties & Responsibilities: Sec. 2-434 Community dialogue and engagement.</p> <p>Annual Focus Areas: Community Engagement.</p>	HRC Resolution	The HRC adopted Resolution A22-1 Community Engagement (in plain language) and two accompanying flyers in English and Spanish to codify the Community Engagement Committee's duties and responsibilities of connecting with the public and supporting the mission of the HRC and OHR.
8/26/22	<p>Duties & Responsibilities: Sec. 2-434 Community dialogue and engagement.</p> <p>Annual Focus Areas: Equity in City Government.</p>	Council Recommendation	The HRC sent a letter to City Council advocating for the creation of a Citywide Language Access Plan and pointing out its adoption of Resolution HR21-1.

Sec. 2-433. (d)

Sec. 2-433. (d) Seek work share agreements with the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (“FEPA”) and the Department of Housing and Urban Development (“HUD-FHAP”) to conduct investigations of employment and housing discrimination on their behalf, and enter into such agreement(s) subject to approval of City Council upon a finding that the agreement(s) would be in the best interest of the City.

Key HRC Actions and Takeaways

As a further step toward pursuing a FHAP workshare, as set forth by Sec. 2-433. (d) of the CHRO, the HRC adopted amendments to the CHRO for recommendation to City Council. The amendments were adopted by City Council on November 21, 2022.

Most duties and responsibilities relating to the pursuit of a Fair Employment Practices Agency (FEPA) workshare with the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) and a Fair Housing Assistance Program (FHAP) workshare with the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) fall to the OHR, with the HRC playing a supporting role. This role, though not further clarified within the ordinance, will have a dramatic effect on the enforcement processes detailed in *Sec. 2-437. Duties and responsibilities – Investigation of individual complaints and issuance of findings* and *Sec. 2-439.1. Enforcement authority – The role of the Commission.*

In CY2021, the HRC prioritized pursuit of the FHAP workshare over the FEPA because simultaneous pursuit of both workshares without additional staff support was not practical. Therefore, work on the FEPA workshare was put on hold for the entirety of CY2022.

Any locality wishing to enter a FHAP workshare with HUD must have enacted a law or ordinance that contains language that is substantially equivalent to federal fair housing law. While the HRC cannot directly amend City policy it has a duty and responsibility to provide recommendations and guidance to City Council pertaining to City policies that affect human rights. The chart below shows the actions the HRC took to progress toward entering a FHAP workshare in CY2022.

Date	Alignment	Action	Summary
9/15/22	Duties & Responsibilities: Sec. 2-433. (d) Federal Workshares Annual Focus Areas: Housing Equity Assessment	Policy Review	The HRC began review of a draft version of the CHRO at its regular meeting on 9/15/22. Commissioners prepared feedback and asked questions ahead of a proposed final review and adoption at the HRC regular meeting on 10/20/22.
10/20/22	Duties & Responsibilities: Sec. 2-433. (d) Federal Workshares Annual Focus Areas: Housing Equity Assessment	Policy Review	The HRC adopted proposed amendments to the CHRO for recommendation to City Council. The most significant proposed amendments made the ordinance substantially equivalent to federal fair housing law, in preparation for the Office of Human Rights entering a Fair Housing Assistance Program (FHAP) workshare. The HRC Director had been working on these revisions since 2021, and they were adopted by City Council on 11/21/22.

Sec. 2-433. (e)

Sec. 2-433. (e) Make recommendations regarding the City’s annual legislative program, with an emphasis on enabling legislation that may be needed to implement programs and policies that will address discrimination.

Key HRC Actions and Takeaways
As directed by Sec. 2-433. (e) of the CHRO, the HRC made legislative recommendations to Council related to housing equity, transportation equity and accessibility, health and food equity, and equity in law enforcement.

This role rests primarily with the HRC with support from the OHR. This role also relates to the HRC’s work under *Sec. 2-434. Duties and responsibilities – Community dialogue and engagement* and *Sec. 2-435. Duties and responsibilities – Systemic issues*.

On October 27, 2022, the HRC submitted recommendations to City Council via a letter which can be found on the “Human Rights Documents” subpage on the “Human Rights” webpage on the City of Charlottesville website and is titled, “20221027 Recommendations for 2023 Legislative Agenda.” The letter provides detailed recommendations in the following four topics:

- 1) Housing Equity
 - a. The City should advocate for enabling legislation to support increasing state assistance for those experiencing homelessness and maintaining stable housing.
 - b. HRC reaffirms our 2021 recommendation to allow localities to bring an action in court for substandard housing conditions.

- c. The City should advocate for enabling legislation to support state legislation to enable local rent control.
- 2) Transportation Equity & Accessibility
 - a. The City should advocate for enabling legislation to increase frequent and reliable transit, in the form of state-wide intercity affordable and accessible public transit options.
 - b. The City should advocate for enabling legislation to increase funding devoted to improving bike and pedestrian infrastructure.
- 3) Health & Food Equity
 - a. The City should advocate for enabling legislation to protect access to reproductive healthcare.
 - b. The City should advocate for opposition to Executive Order No. 1 “On Divisive Concepts.”
 - c. The City should advocate for enabling legislation to improved access to health care for minority and disadvantaged communities, using evidence-based approaches (i.e., Proposed Model Treatment of Transgender Students in Virginia Public Schools) to evaluate any proposed policies.
 - d. The City should advocate for enabling legislation to enact state benefits that address hunger and poor nutrition such as a state-wide universal school meals program.
- 4) Equity in Law Enforcement
 - a. The City should advocate for enabling legislation to reshape policing by enabling alternatives to police response.

These legislative recommendations were guided by results from a poll of the Charlottesville community asking the public what they would like to prioritize in legislation. The poll was a collaborative project between the HRC and OHR Community Outreach & Administrative Specialist. Thanks to publicity generated by the Communications Department through the City website and various social media platforms, the poll garnered 101 responses from community members.

2-433. (f)

Sec. 2-433. (f) Prepare recommendations to policies and procedures the Commission believes are necessary for the performance of the roles, duties and responsibilities assigned to the Commission within this article, and for modifications or operating procedures approved by City Council.

Key HRC Actions and Takeaways
Per Sec. 2-433. (f) of the CRHO, the HRC reviewed and amended its internal Rules and Procedures to redefine a quorum as the majority of serving members. The HRC also adopted recommendations for changes to the CRHO that improved the organization of the ordinance and clarified enforcement procedures for all protected activities.

This role is shared by the HRC and OHR and relates to all other duties and responsibilities detailed in the CHRO. The table below summarizes the recommendations the HRC made to Council in CY2022.

Date	Alignment	Action	Summary
1/20/2022	<p>Duties & Responsibilities: Sec. 2-435 Systemic Issues</p> <p>Annual Focus Areas: HRC & OHR Capacity Expansion</p>	Policy Review	<p>The HRC adopted proposed amendments to its Rules & Procedures. The most significant proposed amendment was to change the definition of a quorum from a minimum of seven Commissioners to a majority of serving Commissioners to allow members to conduct business when there are fewer serving Commission members.</p>
10/20/22	<p>Duties & Responsibilities: Sec. 2-435 Systemic Issues</p> <p>Annual Focus Areas: HRC & OHR Capacity Expansion</p>	Policy Review	<p>In addition to the amendments to the CHRO involving substantial equivalence to federal fair housing law, the HRC also adopted recommendations for changes to the CRHO that improved the organization of the ordinance and clarified enforcement procedures for all protected activities.</p>

Supplemental Information

The following three sections offer additional background information that Commissioners may find helpful when considering priorities for CY2023

OHR Work CY2022

Key OHR Takeaways and Observed Trends

- In CY2022, the OHR received **3,253 incoming contacts**: more incoming contacts than during any previous year in the OHR's history and over 60% more incoming contacts than in CY2021.
- In CY2022, the OHR received **67 new inquiries and complaints** originating in **Charlottesville** (report section 2.2.2.).
- Over the past five years, **housing** was the most often identified protected activity in inquiries and complaints received by the OHR (report section 2.2.3.).
- Over the past five years, **race** was the most frequently identified protected class in inquiries and complaints received by the OHR (report section 2.2.4.).
- Over the past five years, **race** was the most often identified protected class in **employment** discrimination complaints (report section 2.2.5.).
- Over the past five years, **disability** was the most often identified protected class in **housing** discrimination complaints (report section 2.2.5.).
- In CY2022, **2,501 or 58% of total incoming and outgoing contacts** were classified as **navigation contacts**, meaning that the service provided was related to something other than a jurisdictional allegation of discrimination (report section 2.2.6.).

Human Rights Commission Service

Below is a general summary of duties held by Human Rights Commissioners, which may average 5 to 8 hours per month. This is not an exhaustive list, and duties may vary based upon the annual priorities of Council or the Commission.

- Completing IT security training and opening a City email account (approximately 30-45 minutes, one time).
- Completing an initial orientation meeting with the Commission Chair and the Director of the Human Rights Commission (approximately 1 hour, one time).
- Regularly (at least twice weekly) checking a City email account and responding to requests for information and action (approximately 1 hour weekly).
- Attending monthly regular meetings of the Human Rights Commission (approximately 2 hours monthly).
 - The full Commission meets every third Thursday at 6:30pm
- Volunteering to serve on at least one ad hoc committee of the Human Rights Commission and attending regular ad hoc committee work sessions (approximately 1-2 hours monthly).
 - Committees meet every first Thursday at 6:30pm

- Engaging in the review and editing of documents between regular meetings of the Commission and ad hoc committee work sessions to further the work of the Commission (approximately 1-2 hours monthly).
- Attending community outreach and engagement events outside of regular monthly meetings and ad hoc committee meetings (approximately 1-2 hours, every 2-3 months).
- Optional: participating in quarterly meetings of the Virginia Human Rights Association (VAHR) to network with other Commissioners throughout Virginia (1-2 hours, every 3 months).

Charlottesville Human Rights Commission Annual Calendar

Actual activities may vary, but this presents a general summary of activities that occur or could occur throughout the year based on Commission priorities and planned actions.

Month	Activities
January	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Officer Elections • Begin compiling HRC/OHR previous calendar year annual report
February	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Retreat planning • New Commissioner orientation • Finish HRC/OHR previous calendar year annual report
March	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Start of new Commissioner terms • Commission Retreat & Strategic Planning <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Develop an annual work plan with defined focus areas
April	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Form ad hoc Legislative Agenda Committee • Form ad hoc committees related to focus areas defined in retreat
May	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • First Expert Panel <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ For more information regarding focus areas defined in retreat
June	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • First Town Hall Meeting <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Legislative Priorities ○ Feedback on focus areas from retreat • Present HRC/OHR previous calendar year annual report to City Council
July	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Second Expert Panel <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ For more information regarding focus areas defined in retreat
August	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Finalize legislative recommendations to City Council
September	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adopt and submit legislative recommendations to City Council
October	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adopt and submit any recommendations to City Council pertaining to the focus areas defined in retreat
November	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Second Town Hall <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Solicit ideas for focus areas during the next calendar year • Officer nomination committee formation
December	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Officer nomination slate presented

Attachment 3

**2022 Human Rights Commission Annual Retreat
Summary of Identified Focus Areas**

- 1. Housing Equity Assessment** [City Code Article XV. Sec. 2-435, 2-433(a), 2-433(b), &2-433(d)]
 - a. Assess the state of Emergency, Transitional, and Deeply Affordable housing
 - b. Assess the state of the Continuum of Care for people experiencing homelessness
 - i. Review wrap-around services that support access to housing
 1. Mental Health Support
 2. Substance Use Recovery Support
 - c. Test Fair Housing compliance within the Charlottesville housing market
 - i. Potentially partner with Housing Opportunities Made Equal (HOME)
 - d. Continue to pursue Fair Housing Assistance Program (FHAP) workshare with HUD
 - i. Coinciding with an increase in OHR staffing (see focus area 4)
 - e. Provide recommendations to Council based on the above assessments
- 2. Community Engagement** [City Code Article XV. Sec. 2-433(b) & Sec. 2-434]
 - a. Listen to community member concerns
 - i. Town Hall meetings
 - ii. In-person events
 - b. Share information about HRC initiatives with community members
 - i. In-person events
 - ii. Social media
 - c. Collaborate with other groups doing related work
 - i. Commissioners will engage with other City boards and commissions
 - ii. Commissioners will engage local community groups and organizations
 - d. Provide recommendations to Council to improve community access to public meetings
- 3. Equity in City Government Review** [City Code Article XV. Sec. 2-433(c) & Sec. 2-435]
 - a. Engage with the Charlottesville Police Department and Police Civilian Oversight Board (PCOB)
 - b. Review City Council's equity priorities and encourage accountability and follow-through
 - c. Review City budgeting priorities through an equity lens
 - d. Provide recommendations to Council regarding potential actions resulting from the above.
- 4. Human Rights Commission (HRC) and Office of Human Rights (OHR) Capacity Expansion** [City Code Article XV. Sec. 2-433(a), 2-433(f), 2-434, & 2-435]
 - a. Advocate for adequate staffing in the OHR
 - i. Demonstrate to City Council the need to add an Investigator and potentially an Intake Counselor to OHR staff, as a pre-requisite for fulfilling City Code Article XV. Sec. 2-433(d)
 - b. Explore opportunities for Commissioners to engage in training and workshops that enhance understanding of human rights, equity, diversity, and inclusion.